

**THE STRUGGLE OF MUNIBA MAZARI IN FACING INEQUALITY:
A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF MUNIBA'S SPEECH**

¹⁾Daiya Setianni G. Putri, ²⁾Santa Maya Pramusita
The Graduate Student of English Language Study
Sanata Dharma University
daiyaputri@gmail.com
santamaya18@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Gender inequality is the one of global issues that still happen to this day. Research has shown that inequality regarding gender mostly occurs in developing countries, causing many women on those countries lose many of their rights. Sadly, this also happens to Pakistani disabled Woman, Muniba Mazari. During her lifetime, she has received many unequal treatment from her family and husband. This paper aims to find out the struggle of Muniba Mazari in facing gender inequality so that the readers can get clear depiction on how women are treated unequally in some countries and to improve the readers' awareness in responding to such social problem. This research was applied qualitative descriptive method by presenting the inequality based on Muniba Mazari's speech. The applied theory came from Bourdieu of social structure and doxa, as well as Appraisal Theory will be used as a tool in disclosing the inequality. The results show that the inequality that Muniba got from her family and husband are sourced from the strong social structure and doxa spreading around her. Meanwhile, the appraisal theory shows that the most data implies unhappiness as Muniba did not accept her condition and felt oppressed of her previous life and unhappy marriage.

Keyword: Critical Discourse Analysis, Muniba Mazari's speech, Inequality

I. INTRODUCTION

Muniba Mazari is one of the inspiring women in Pakistan. She is known because of her struggle as a disabled woman who tries to approach herself to the normal society. She used to live normally like all people do and getting married in a young age. When she was 21, however, she experienced car accident which led to her loss of walking ability and give birth.

Despite the great misfortune, Muniba Mazari did not give up for granted. Instead, her loss had eventually turned her into a woman that is brave to live the life she deeply wants. She also managed to escape from the dictatorship of her parents that had confined her all this times. Shortly after the accident, she got divorce, pursue her career as an artist, and adopt a son. At the age of less than thirty, her passion and patience had brought her into one of BBC hundred women in 2015 and Forbes 30 under 30 in 2016. Until now, Muniba Mazari often delivers motivational speeches in various occasions.

The concern of this paper is on one of Muniba's motivational speech that implicitly tells the unequal treatment she once got from her family and husband. In every sentence of her speech, she expressed how the world treated her after she got spine injury. The writer's main focus here is disclosing the inequality that happened in the life of Muniba Mazari which is depicted through her speech by applied theory from Bourdieu about the social structure and doxa. To support this analysis, Appraisal Theory by J.R Martin and P.R.R White will be used to help the writer map the positive and the feeling depicted in Muniba's speech.

II. MATERIAL AND METHOD

This part divided into two parts which explain the theoretical framework in conducting this research and the method to analyze the data. The explanation can be shown as the following sub chapter below:

2.1 Theoretical Framework

The theories from J.R Martin and P.R.R White are used in finding out the appraisal items that are reflected on her feelings. Meanwhile, Bourdieu's theory used here are concerning on social structure and doxa. Critical Discourse Analysis is discourse analytical research that primarily studies the way social-power abuse and inequality are enacted, reproduced, legitimated, and resisted by text and talk in the social and political context" (Van Dijk, 2015). The critical discourse analysis cannot be separated from the power of someone which dominated the others. By this chance, Bourdieu (1972) had stated that

“structured structures predisposed to function as structuring structures, that is, as principles of the generation and structuring of practices and representations which can be objectively" regulated" and" regular" without in any way being the product of obedience to rules.”

According to Bourdieu (1972) systems of classification by human mind that reproduce, in their logical thinking and the objective classes, by considering the divisions by gender, lifespan or position it relates to make specific contribution to the process of reproduces the power relations as a result, by securing the misrecognition, then the recognition, of the arbitrariness on which they are based on correspondences between the objective order and the subjective principles of organization (as in ancient societies) the natural and social world appears as self-evident. This experience named as doxa or schemes of thought that produce objectivity perception based misrecognition of the limits of the cognition that they make possible, thereby founding immediate adherence, in the doxic mode, to the world of tradition experienced as a natural world" and taken for granted.

By proving the result of critical discourse analysis, it needs linguistic tools to mapping feelings. The appraisal theory is used as a framework mapping feeling which the text construed in English that refers to the way of thinking as attitude. This framework involves three semantic regions which are: emotion (affect), ethics (judgement) and aesthetics (appreciation).

The first attitude is affect, based on Painter (2003) affect or emotion as “arguably or feeling from the heart of these three regions since it is expressive resource we are born with and embody physiologically from almost the moment of birth” (p.42). By then, this emotive refers to the affect which has two kinds, such as: positive and negative feelings. This group of emotion were divided into three: un/happiness, in/security, and dis/satisfaction. The un/happiness variable concerned with the moods of feeling such as happy or sad. In/security refers to feeling of peace and anxiety in relation to our environs and the last is dis/satisfaction that deals with feeling of achievement and frustration in the relation to the activities. (Halliday in Martin: 1994)

According to Eggins and Slade in Martin (1997), judgement is construing our attitude towards people and the way they behave. It can be classified into two major namely judgement of esteem that deals social esteem and tends to be policed in oral culture like gossip or chat; and judgement of sanction that deals with social sanction and tend to be policed in writing such as rules, law, etc.

Martin (2000b) refers appreciation to as “construing our evaluation of things, especially things we make and performances we give, but also including the natural phenomena—what such things are worth” (p.56). Appreciation can be classified into three major namely: reaction, composition and valuation. Reaction is related to the affection or emotive, while composition is related to perception, and valuation is related to cognition.

2.2 Research Method

The data was chosen from one of Muniba Mazari's speech as her speech contains her life experience being the women that have no rights to speak her feelings. This study aimed to give the explanation of the purposed formulated above. The data was collected by watching her speech from youtube.com and transcribe her speech into a text. Then, the writers focused on the sentence or utterance which tells about the inequality woman that she experienced and the depression that she developed after knowing that she was injured. After that, the writers criticize it by concerning on doxa and social structure in the text. As the evidence that Muniba experienced inequality, the appraisal theory used by mapping her feelings when she uttered her speech.

The qualitative method was applied to analyze the data. In a subsequent section, the writers have analyzed the feelings of oppression as well as the inequality that Muniba felt as a woman in

conservative family. The technique was descriptive the data which represent the the inequality by examined her personal feelings towards her struggle in life.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

As the results, the writers have found these two theories support each other both in mapping feeling of Mazari towards the social issues such as social structure which leads her to unhappy marriage and doxa as the root of the inequality. Through the words that she uttered in her speech, it helps the audience to understand the feelings when she experienced the social structure in her family and her struggle to live as disability. In the following subchapters, it can be clear how the feeling of Mazari through her struggle of the following issue in the social life based on the theory from Bourdieu.

3.1 Appraisal Analysis On Muniba's Speech Regarding Gender Inequality

Muniba Mazari is known because of her great struggle in healing herself from the spine injury that she experienced 9 years ago, and from the heartbreak caused by the unhappy marriage. To share her experiences, she often delivered motivational speeches to the audiences. As this speech purposed to give motivation, she expressed many wise words that can strenghten people for not giving up on life. To mapping her feeling, this research equipped with Appraisal Theory. According to Painter in Martin (2003), feeling that are constructed in the text "refers to the system of meaning as attitude. The system involves three semantic regions covering what is traditionally referred to as emotion, ethics, and aesthetic" (p.42). These three semantic regions later we called as affect, judge and appreciation.

The writers have provided the tables to shows the feeling depicted in Muniba Mazari's speech as follow:

Table 3.1 Feeling Depicted in Muniba Mazari's Speech

Attitude	Types	Positive	Negative
Affect	Happiness (hap)	7	10
	Satisfaction (sat)	9	2
	Security (sec)	2	1
Judgement	Capacity (cap)	1	5
	Normality (norm)	3	2
Appreciation	Valuation (val)	8	4
	Reaction (reac)	3	3
	Composition (comp)	3	1

By looking at this table, it can be noticed that the most data from her speech reflects unhappiness. This probably because firstly, she cannot accept her disabled condition and inability to give birth. Secondly, she desired to change her life and move on from her condition. However, there are also some data implying happiness and evaluation that appear by the time she shows her gratefulness. Indeed, she finally lives happily because she can live the life she wants by way of divorce, being an artist, and adopting son. The brief explanation of those feelings will be listed in the following passages.

3.1.1 Affect

The data found through her speech draw both the positive and negative feeling of Muniba. Her unhappy feeling seen when her father forced her to marry young, while in fact, she wants to pursue her dreams as the artist first. As the result of the marriage, she ended up being a housewife instead of artist. The following sentence is the evidence of her unhappiness.

My father **wanted** me to get married..... (Mazari, 2017)

The feeling reflect in the bold word is negative feeling or it can be categorized as unhappiness. The appraiser in the word *wanted* is Muniba's father who eventually succeeded in breaking Muniba's dream to be an artist by forcing her to marry young. *Wanted* is expression of his father desire to forced her daughter Muniba to get married. Therefore, this word belongs to positive desire because it told her father's hope and later on forcing Muniba as he wanted.

**THE STRUGGLE OF MUNIBA MAZARI IN FACING INEQUALITY: A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS
OF MUNIBA'S SPEECH
(Daiya Setianni G. Putri; Santa Maya Pramusita)**

In the next sentence, Muniba also expressed unhappy feeling as her fate changed her into disabled woman by a single car accident. It can be seen in the sentence below:

That day, I was **devastated** (Mazari, 2017)

The word *devastated* here point out the emotion of Muniba that was deeply sad because after the accident, she was convicted unable to give birth. While what she always believed on is that real women should be able to give birth because women destiny is being mothers. Thus, the appraiser towards the appraised in this sentence is the news that she would not be able to give birth anymore. The word *devastated* is tried to appraise the news of her as this news directly makes her disappointed and leads her to unhappy feeling as this word belongs to negative happiness. After hearing this news, she felt upset and hopeless to have a great life.

Another negative feeling can be seen from this sentences:

... but I'm **tired** of looking at these white walls in the hospital and **wearing** these white scrubs. Bring me some colours, bring me some small canvas. I **want** to paint. (Mazari, 2017)

As we can see, the word *tired* and *wearing* here are expression of negative feeling. She appraised the white walls and white scrubs as the sign of sadness that bring her to another frustration. Those words are categorized as unhappiness because it brings bad effect to Muniba's emotion.

Meanwhile, the word *want* expressed the action that she would take to heal her sadness and frustration. This action can be classified as satisfaction since she achieved positive action towards negativity.

After understand all the unhappiness which is the domination feeling through the beginning of the speech, later she tried to motivated the audience by inserting her experiences when she tried to make revolution in her life. The feeling that she tried to express mostly in positive affection. She then fought her fears by doing this:

I **liberated** myself by setting him free, and I made myself emotionally so **strong** (Mazari, 2017)

Through the statement above, Muniba expressed the feeling of secure by stating the word *liberate*, indicating that she got the freedom after being oppressed by her husband for several years. This word tried to appraise her life as she felt secure and comfort if she divorced to her husband at the time. She wanted to live her life without being oppressed by her husband. The word *strong* here also be another positive security since she attempted to strengthen herself. *Strong* in this sentence tried to appraised Muniba's feeling after she have been through her hard life. She believed that she could reach her dream without her husband who always oppressed her. She tried to not being sad after she have to make a distance from her husband.

In the end of the speech, she tried to cheer the audience by giving some motivation based on her true life experience. After the hardest time she have been through, she can pick some happiness as the expression below:

Real **happiness** lies in gratitude. So we **grateful** be a life and life every moment. (Mazari, 2017)

The bold word *happiness* in the sentence express positive happiness as this word tried to appraise life. In this sentence, Muniba wanted to convey that in every sadness event there will be happiness joined if people could get up and change from that condition. And word *grateful* is tried to appraise the life as Muniba wanted to remind people of what they have been through and what they have in their life. By saying those things, Muniba express positive affection towards her life and to persuade people to not give up on their life.

3.1.2 Judgement

In this speech, social esteem is found and classified into normality and capacity. Muniba herself tried to give opinion about the social structure which control her life. As the example, we can take a look in this statement:

I belong to a very **conservative** family (Mazari, 2017)

This sentence implies Muniba's judgement toward her family as being strict to the culture in which 'a good daughter never says no to their parents'. She said so because her father forced her to get married with someone that she did not like, but all she can say was yes. The word conservative in this sentence is the appraising items which tried to appraise Muniba's family's behavior. This word expresses social esteem dealing with normality since this opinion was given by Muniba directly to her family which force her to live a life that she does not want.

Another quotation is the judgement that delivered by the doctor to her.

Well, I heard that you wanted to be an artist, but you **ended up** being a housewife. I have bad news for you. You **won't be able** to paint again. (Mazari, 2017)

The word *ended up* clearly indicates how the doctor here (as the appraiser of this word) judge Muniba as the young girl who cannot reach her dream as an artist since she became a housewife. The doctor also judge Muniba for not being able to paint again by appraising the condition of her spinal injury. The writers see this as negative judgement of capability because it is mentioned that the disability of Muniba will make her unable to reach her dream.

Lastly, through her speech, Muniba conveys judgement which is:

People think that they will **not be accepted** by other people, because we, in the world of perfect people, are **imperfect**. (Mazari, 2017)

These bold words can be classified as the negative normality of judgement, in which Muniba judged the behavior of disable people that think society will not accept them due to their imperfect bodies. In fact, such thought is completely wrong because disabled people have the same rights with other people in terms of showing their existence in the world. The appraiser items are: *not be accepted* which directly appraised the disability people who could not live normal like anybody else and *imperfect* that appraised the disability people who have flaw and should adapt in the world full of perfect people.

3.1.3 Appreciation

Muniba also appreciated many things through her speech. Even though she experienced unfortunate journey, she has positive way to face the truth by giving appreciation and live full of gracefull. The appreciation in Muniba's speech can be seen in this sentences:

But that whole injury that **changed** me and my life completely was the spine injury.... I got the **complete transaction** of my spinal cord. Those two and a half months in the hospital were **dreadful**. I was at the verge of despair. (Mazari, 2017)

Those bold words can be categorized as the appreciation of things that Muniba's express during her recovery in the hospital. She appraised the spinal injury as the moment of changing her life by using *changed* as the appraisal items. This word can be categorized as negative valuation towards her spinal injury. On the contrary, the word *complete transaction* is the appreciation of the spinal cord that she had experienced. It is categorized as negative composition since it shows Munabi's thought about her condition through the process of rescuing her body after accident. Lastly, the word *dreadful* is her appreciation of her recovery in hospital as she believed that the hospital was full of sadness. It expresses her sadness after the car accident which make her hospitalized for a while.

After the several months being in the sadness, Muniba tried to build her life in such a way that she believed as her own. She started to paint and make a creative painting as she believed it would recover her psychology. The sentence above showed her struggle and her appreciation.

What an **amazing** therapy it was... People used to come and say, "What **lovely** painting. **So much color!**" (Mazari, 2017)

This sentence showed her struggle to fight her frustration. She started to paint and she appraised the paint as the therapy to her. The word *amazing* here is appraisal items which reflect her truly expression and her appreciation toward the painting. In addition, the following bold words implies people's appreciation toward her painting by saying that it is *lovely* and *so much color*. Those three appraisal items can be categorized as the positive valuation on the things (paint) and moment (her therapy).

In her speech, Muniba also gives some motivation to the audience by giving appreciation to the world she lived in, as stated below:

We have this **amazing** fantasy about life. (Mazari, 2017)

From that sentence, we can notice that Muniba as the appraiser gives an appreciation about life. She conveyed that each people should have a dream to build their life. The word *amazing* is appraisal item which used to give positive valuation about life as she believed that life is like a fantasy, in which it is beautiful if we try to get our dreams. This appraisal items can be identified as positive valuation.

3.2 Bourdieu's Analysis Concerning Inequality in Muniba's Speech

To analyze the inequality that Muniba had experience, the writers use Bourdieu's theory on social structure class and doxa. The explanation of each part will be elaborated in the following sections.

3.2.1 Social Structures Leading to Inequality

According to Hiraide (2013), gender inequality is an unfair distribution of several resources which placed one of the gender (mostly women) as the repressed one. Research done by Jayachandran (2014) shows that gender inequality happens a lot in developing countries such as in Pakistan—which is the origin country of Muniba Mazari. This inequality can encompass the disparities for women in education and health, as well as the restriction of women's power within marriage. Concerning the last aspect, Jayachandran explains further that women in family have few or even no chance in decision-making. When their parents asked them to get married, they should obey it even though perhaps they have an objection. In a married life as well, women should always be submissive to whatever their husbands say. They are deeply controlled and lack of freedom of choice. Sadly, this kind of condition occurs in the life of Muniba Mazari. In one occasion, she implicitly told the audience about the inequalities she had ever experienced. The writers attempt to reveal those inequalities using Bourdieu's theory of social structures, which is "structures of relations between groups – the sexes or age-classes – or between social-classes" (p.97). It is produced by social interaction as well as an "application of the structuring principle that is dominant in a certain respect" (p.34).

The story in her speech began with unequal treatment she got from her family. At that time, she said:

I was eighteen years old when I got married. I belong to a very conservative family, a baloch family, where good daughters never say no to their parents. (Mazari, 2017)

From that sentence, we can actually see a strong social structures among parents and daughter in Balochistan—a region on the Iranian plateau of Pakistan. Parents as the oldest people in family are regarded to have higher position who can organize everything including their children as they please. On the other way round, children are kind of passive creatures that should not say 'no' to the order of their parents. As happened in Muniba's life, her father want her to get married at the age of eighteen. Knowing that she did not have another choice, with all sincerity, she said to her father; '*If that makes you happy, I'll say yes*'. Such social structure surely leads to age-class inequality that oppress children's rights, for they are also entitled to their lives. Muniba Mazari, in this case, actually has right

**THE STRUGGLE OF MUNIBA MAZARI IN FACING INEQUALITY: A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS
OF MUNIBA'S SPEECH
(Daiya Setianni G. Putri; Santa Maya Pramusita)**

to decide whether she wants to marry young or not. Nevertheless, her rights have been imprisoned by the social structure that place parents as the controller of her life and force her to be obedient all the times.

Social structures can also be seen from her relationship with her ex husband as reflected from her statement as follow:

And of course... it was never a happy marriage. Just about after two years of getting married, about nine years ago, I made a car accident. Somehow, my husband fall asleep, and the car fell in the ditch. He managed to jump out, saved himself. I'm happy for him, but I stayed inside the car, and I sustained a lot of injuries. (Mazari, 2017)

In spite of not being told explicitly why the marriage did not go well, her whole utterances vividly reflects the selfishness of her husband that did not even try to assist Muniba during the accident. It somehow also indicates sexes inequality because women, in this case Muniba Mazari, regarded as unimportant creature that can be left for granted in dangerous situation. It then made Muniba became the downtrodden one as she got so many body injuries. The writers regard this as severe inequality which is very detrimental for women. In fact, women have the same position with men so that they also have right to be saved.

3.2.2 Doxa; The Root of Inequality in Muniba's Life

Besides the social structures, the writers also notice some doxas that become the root of inequalities happened in Muniba's life. Doxa alone can be understood as the schemes of thought and perception of the authority which is considered as the people's scheme and is connected to power of individual and the idea of people in general (Bourdieu, as cited in Fowler, 1997:167).

The most obvious doxa depicted from Muniba's speech is that '*good daughters never say no to their parents*'. The writers deeply understand that parents are the representative of God in the world, hence, children should put their highest respect to their parents. However, demanding children to *always* obey the command of their parents is certainly something wrong. This is because parents are also human who can make mistake and wrong argument. Not all thoughts, argument, and decisions that parents made are rights and good for their children. There should be a time where they listen to their children's thought. Such doxa certainly causes into the spreading of inequality which harms children. Their rights in having what they really desire somehow become restricted, and their freedom are also abolished. This can actually be categorized as a violation of children's rights, but since the society has accepted, it is considered normal.

Second doxa that the writers find is that '*disabled people will not be accepted by society*'. The writers consider that doxa as the root of inequality because it makes people think that disability is a big misfortune. It can also give a pressure to disabled people because—with such kind of thought in their mind—society may regard disabled people differently. They may see disabled people as the marginalized ones that are not accepted by the society. In fact, it is such a big mistake to have such kind of perception in mind because it is not our condition which determine whether or not we are accepted by the society, but our behavior is. Through her speech, Muniba has proven the world that although she is disabled, she can be recognized by many people and even receive many awards because she tried to be more opened.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

In a conclusion, the inequality that Muniba got in her life basically comes from the social structure and doxa which is trusted and hold by people around her. The age social structure between Muniba and her parents urged her to always be obedient with her parents.. On the other hand, sexes social structure in her region had made her looked down upon by her husband. Concerning the doxa, the writers notice two doxa that becomes the roots of inequality in Muniba's life. The first one is the doxa that good daughters never say no to their parents and the second is that disabled people will not be accepted by society.

These points are supported by the use of Appraisal Theory in analysing the sentences of Muniba's speech. It is proven that she prefers to use negative words to show her unhappy feeling in facing her

**THE STRUGGLE OF MUNIBA MAZARI IN FACING INEQUALITY: A CRITICAL DISCOURSE ANALYSIS
OF MUNIBA'S SPEECH
(Daiya Setianni G. Putri; Santa Maya Pramusita)**

tragic destiny. In the end of her speech, however, she tried to motivate the audiences for not giving up on life and for always chase their dreams.

V. REFERENCES

Bourdieu, O. (1972). *The Outline of a Theory and Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Dick, T.A.V. (2015). *The Handbook of Discourse Analysis (2nd, ed)*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

Fowler, B. (1997). *Pierre Bourdieu and Cultural Theory; Critical Investigations*. London: Sage Publications Press.

Hiraide, L. (2013). *Social Inequality*. Retrieved October 29th, 2017 from http://www.bishopstopfords.enfield.sch.uk/wp-content/uploads/2014/11/social_inequality.pdf

Jayachandran, S. (2014). *The Roots of Gender Inequality in Developing Countries*. Retrieved December 6th, 2017 from http://faculty.wcas.northwestern.edu/~sjv340/roots_of_gender_inequality.pdf

Martin, J. R and White, P.RR. 2005. *The Language of Evaluation*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan